

Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act

Wyoming Eligible Training Providers Program Outcomes Report

Prepared by Matthew Halama, Senior Economist

Research & Planning, Wyoming Department of Workforce Services

April 13, 2021

Abstract:

In 2014, the Workforce Innovation & Opportunity Act (WIOA) amended the Workforce Investment Act of 1988. WIOA provides training in skills that lead to employment in high-demand occupations. The State of Wyoming is responsible for providing a comprehensive report annually. WIOA requires collection of WIOA and non-WIOA participant information from Eligible Training Providers (ETPs) who accept WIOA participants in their approved training programs. As of this publication, Wyoming is currently unable to complete a full performance report that is due October 1, 2021 until all non-WIOA participant data has been uploaded to make proper comparisons between WIOA and non-WIOA participants. The portions of the performance report that can be completed details information available for Fiscal Years (FY) 2017-2019.

Introduction:

The Workforce Innovation & Opportunity Act (WIOA) of 2014 amended the Workforce Investment Act of 1998 and aims to provide “individuals with barriers to employment, access to and opportunities for the employment, education, training, and support services they need to succeed in the labor market” (H. R. 803, 2014). Training offered through WIOA ETPs to adults, dislocated workers, and youth must meet certain eligibility requirements. WIOA section 116 (d)(4) stipulates that in order to continue to receive formula grants, Wyoming has to report performance information annually about ETPs to the Department of Labor’s Employment and Training Administration (ETA). Eligible training providers are entities with job training approved by the Wyoming Workforce Development Council (WWDC). The WWDC fund training for WIOA program participants through individual training accounts (ITAs). A comprehensive list of ETPs and associated programs currently approved by WWDC for ITA funding is listed on employer tab of the Wyoming at Work website (wyomingatwork.com). Currently, there are 38 ETPs operating 85 locations in Wyoming. Laramie has 11 ETPs, the most in the state,

followed by Casper with 10 and Cheyenne with nine. The ETPs include the community colleges and university, driving, cosmetology, automotive technology, and certified nursing and dental assistant schools.

Performance reporting is important as it imparts realistic expectations about the programs and training providers by giving information on program costs, completion rates, employment prospects and median earnings for participants and non-participants two and four quarters after exiting a program. The performance reporting reflects WIOA and non-WIOA participants' outcomes within a training program provided by an ETP. The structure of this report will describe the information that is required from ETP's for performance reporting on both WIOA and non-WIOA participants of a training program. Results including summary statistics for Fiscal Years (FY) 2017, 2018 and 2019. A discussion as to what improvements Wyoming needs to incorporate in order to provide a complete performance report is contained in this report.

Methodology:

Under the WIOA ETP Agreement and General Provisions ETPs are required to provide the following performance data annually:

- The total number of participants who received training services from a WIOA program.
- The total number of participants who exited from training services.
- The average cost per participant who received training services and the number of participants with barriers to employment who were served by a WIOA program.

In addition, the following performance information is required for WIOA and non-WIOA participants who received training provided by an ETP:

- The total number of individuals exiting a program of study.

- The percentage of individuals who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from a program.
- The percentage of individuals who are in unsubsidized employment during the fourth quarter after exit from a program.
- The median earnings of individuals who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from a program.
- The percentage of individuals who obtain a recognized postsecondary credential, or secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent; during participation in or within one year after exit from the program.

Unsubsidized employment refers to employment not supported by state or federal funds.

Placement in employment is defined as the participants' employment immediately after completion of training (DWS).

The data sources used to capture this information in this report came from the wage records (WR) database, Wyoming Department of Transportation (WYDOT), Wyoming Department of Education (WYDOE), University of Wyoming (UW), Wyoming Community College Commission (WCCC) and the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Participant Individual Record Layout (PIRL) files. Individuals selected are assigned to the WIOA youth, adult or dislocated worker program. The Department of Workforce Services Research and Planning Division (R&P) combined three programs and categorized them as WIOA, otherwise the results would be non-disclosable, making performance reporting much more difficult.

The WR database contains employment and wage data for all unemployment insurance covered individuals from 1992 to present. The variables include SSN, year, quarter, UI account and total wages.

R&P, through the Workforce Data Quality Initiative (WDQI), also collects enrollment and graduation data from Wyoming's community colleges and the University of Wyoming. R&P is able to compare those in the WIOA programs to non-WIOA participants grouped by Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes. CIP codes come from the Institute of Education Sciences (IES), a statistics, research, and evaluation arm of the U.S. Department of Education. CIP codes start at two digits describing the program content; four-digit CIP codes provide detailed information within a program, while the six-digit CIP code describes the degree program. Nine individuals had an out of date CIP code 51.1601, which was used in the 2000 CIP code handbook. That CIP code was changed to 51.3801 to reflect the 2010 standards.

The WIOA PIRL file variables used for performance reporting are the participants' social security number, WIOA program (youth, adult, or dislocated worker), the Classification of Instructional Program code information associated with the program the eligible training provider provided, the exit date of the training program, completed status, and the participants' completion date.

In order to gather performance data for WIOA and non-WIOA participants, The Wyoming Department of Workforce Services (DWS) sends an excel spreadsheet to all ETPs involved in a WIOA program to complete. The spreadsheet provided contains multiple sheets listing a program ID, program name, and CIP code information. The following columns within each sheet ETPs to complete the following information: social security number (SSN), start date of WIOA program, status (completed or not completed), exit date of WIOA program, credential obtained, employed two quarters after program completion, and employed four quarters after program completion. This information is uploaded by the ETP to the Wyoming at Work (W@W) website, which is later uploaded into the WIOA PIRL file. In addition, the Wyoming at Work website has program, credential, provider, and total program cost information by clicking on the employer tab and selecting ETPL Programs.

All data sets are combined using SSNs. The wage record database contains the quarterly wages and employment information. The wages from the wage record database were used as businesses are required by law to provide quarterly wage and employment information leading to a high degree of reliability. Median wages were calculated and grouped by CIP codes within an ETP. University of Wyoming and Community College data were combined with the WR data. If program participants completed training then the completion date of their program was selected, otherwise the day they exited the program was used. Wyoming's fiscal years run from July 1 to June 30, depending on when the completion date or exit date occurred it is grouped within the appropriate fiscal year. For example, FY 2017 ran from July 1, 2016 to June 30, 2017. Data were available for FY 2017-2019. For the purposes of this paper fiscal years 2017, 2018, and 2019 were grouped together to provide more information on program outcomes. In 2017, there were 95 WIOA programs under the label training level provided by eligible training providers. Only 24 of those programs have data that can be shown for WIOA participants, the other 71 are non-disclosable due to confidentiality issues, which means about 25% of the WIOA program data can be shown. By rolling-up the three available fiscal years (2017, 2018, and 2019) and adjusting quarterly wages to the consumer price index, there are 169 WIOA programs and of those about 30.0% or 50 programs have outcomes that are reportable for WIOA participants (see Table 1a).

Results:

Before going into the results, it is important to note how many ETPs have uploaded performance data for WIOA and non-WIOA participants. Table 1b displays by year how many ETPs have uploaded performance data and how many have not uploaded performance data. Throughout the 2017-2019 fiscal years, 33 programs have WIOA and non-WIOA participant data uploaded while 76 programs only have WIOA participant data uploaded.

Table 2 shows that within the 169 WIOA programs, 140 individuals were in programs by themselves or with one other participant which means we could not report statistics for those WIOA programs due to confidentiality issues. Of the remaining 513 participants, completion status is available for 408. There were 224 participants with wages in the second quarter after exit and 203 participants with wages in the fourth quarter after exit after combining all data sets and calculating performance outcomes listed below. If we had non-participant data at least some performance reporting could be completed. This would allow individuals to make informed decisions related to training programs. The culmination of this effort is Table 3.

Table 3 displays ETPLs with outcomes from 2017-2019. Many of the WIOA programs have the label N/D meaning the information is non-disclosable even with the rollup of the fiscal years 2017-2019. In addition, the majority of the training level column states “Program Data Not Available”, this means non-participant data has not been uploaded to the system. Laramie County Community Colleges’ medical insurance specialist/medical biller program the WIOA participant data is non-disclosable while program data is not available for non-participants. These are missed opportunities as those planning a future career will not have an idea of the wage outcomes for those programs in Wyoming. Comparing program data to Casper Colleges’ fire science/fire-fighting program the WIOA participants are non-disclosable while non-participant program data is available. With the majority of WIOA program outcomes being non-disclosable having non-participant data being available is beneficial due to seeing wage outcomes for these programs.

The largest ETPL was the Sage Corporation, a truck driving school that provides training programs for commercial driver’s licenses, which had 81 individuals registered (see Table 3). The second largest was Mountain West Commercial Driving Schools of Wyoming, also a truck driving school with 32 participants; followed by Hazel B Suedes R.N., a nursing assistant program with 29 individuals. ETPLs with the largest median wages that had WIOA participants with reportable statistics are Laramie County

Community College, Casper Community College District, and Northern Wyoming Community College Districts registered nursing, nursing administration program with median wages of \$14,527, \$14,450 and \$14,414 two quarters after leaving the program.

Discussion:

ETPs are required to provide information from non-WIOA participants to meet the requirements of the Training and Employment Guidance Letter (TEGL) Number 3-18. One concern is that small training providers have to provide information on non-WIOA participants. In Wyoming, many ETPs have a low enrollment of WIOA funded participants and cannot disclose performance outcomes without potentially exposing the identity of the participant seeking training. In addition, these same ETPs have limited or no program data on non-WIOA participants. R&P is continuing its recommendation that ETPs are contacted to assess which and how many would be open to supplying non-WIOA participant data to DWS.

To date, Wyoming has not met the requirements of the Eligible Training Provider Performance reporting that is required annually. Wyoming has waivers in place until June 30, 2021 that have allowed the state to receive WIOA funding while not having to provide annual performance reports due to burden and being a single area state with minimal funding. A single area state refers to Wyoming having one Workforce Investment Board (WIB) aka the Wyoming Workforce Development Council. The consequences of not providing annual performance data can have serious repercussions to the ETP's. Under WIOA title 1-B, the criteria for a training provider to retain its status as an eligible training provider is to provide accurate information and deliver results. The State of Wyoming can revoke a provider's eligibility and remove from the list for false reporting, for violating a provision of title I of WIOA, or for failure to meet required performance outcomes. A training provider can be removed from the ETPL if the provider has not been utilized for WIOA funded training within the last five years. ETPs

removed from the ETPL can reapply for inclusion at any time or appeal the decision. If an ETP is removed for cause Wyoming will only be liable for payment rendered before the effective date of termination, provided that those services were performed in accordance of the WIOA ETP agreement and general provisions. If Wyoming fails to provide a performance report to the Department of Labor the possible sanctions to the WWDC include reduced funding for training programs in the State.

With the waivers in place, the State should upload all data available and be proactive in acquiring and uploading WIOA non-participant data. The information about programs and outcomes are valuable and having these unpublished performance reports for prior years with no missing data could have provided insights about specific ETPs and whether these partnerships should continue.

Under the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act, the Wyoming Workforce Development Council approves training programs provided by Wyoming's Community Colleges, the University of Wyoming, and private companies. These eligible training providers are required to provide performance-reporting data on WIOA and non-WIOA participants. With current waivers in place, Wyoming at this time cannot provide a complete performance report. The portion of the report Wyoming can mostly complete come from the University of Wyoming and the community colleges because R&P can link data between the WIOA PIRL file, wage records, University of Wyoming, and the community colleges. Wyoming cannot complete portions of the report where non-WIOA data has not been uploaded by ETPs into Wyoming at Work and subsequently the WIOA PIRL File to allow complete performance reporting.

Table 1b: How many programs have uploaded performance data by year

Year	How many programs have uploaded performance data	How many programs have not uploaded performance data	Total Programs
2017	19	75	94
2018	26	62	88
2019	16	41	57

Grouped by Fiscal Year

FY2017-2019	33	76	109
-------------	----	----	-----

Table 1a: How many WIOA programs have disclosable data (FY2017 vs Rollup of FY2017-2019)

Fiscal Year	Programs with disclosable data	Programs with undisclosable data	Total Programs	% Disclosable
FY2017	24	71	95	25.3%
FY2017-2019	50	119	169	29.6%

Table 2: Summary Statistics for Fiscal Years 2017-2019

# of Programs	Participants		Total Participants	programs completers	participants completers	programs with wagesp2	participants with wagesp2	programs with wagesp4	participants with wagesp4
	by Program	Size							
98	1	98	98	0	NULL	0	NULL	0	NULL
21	2	42	42	0	NULL	0	NULL	0	NULL
11	3	33	33	3	9	1	3	1	3
8	4	32	32	5	18	2	7	2	7
7	5	35	35	6	25	2	6	2	6
3	6	18	18	3	16	0	NULL	0	NULL
4	7	28	28	4	21	2	10	2	9
1	8	8	8	1	7	0	NULL	0	NULL
2	9	18	18	2	18	2	14	2	12
1	11	11	11	1	10	1	6	1	7
1	13	13	13	1	9	1	6	1	6
2	14	28	28	2	21	2	16	2	12
1	15	15	15	1	11	1	8	1	8
2	17	34	34	2	30	2	17	2	14
1	20	20	20	1	19	1	14	1	13
3	26	78	78	3	68	3	42	3	37
1	29	29	29	1	24	1	20	1	18
1	32	32	32	1	31	1	23	1	21
1	81	81	81	1	71	1	32	1	30
Total	169	303	653	38	408	23	224	23	203